

CITY OF SAN JOSÉ, CALIFORNIA
 Department of Planning, Building and Code Enforcement
 801 North First Street, Room 400
 San José, California 95110-1795

Hearing Date/Agenda Number
 H.L.C. 11/06/02 Item 3.b.

File Number
 HP02-020

Application Type
 Historic Preservation Permit

Council District SNI
 6 NA

Planning Area
 Central

Assessor's Parcel Number(s)
 274-24-026

STAFF REPORT

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Completed by: Sally Notthoff Zarnowitz

Location: Northwesterly corner of Naglee Avenue and Dana Avenue (1600 Naglee Avenue)

Gross Acreage: 11

Net Acreage: 11

Net Density: n/a

Existing Zoning: R-1-8 Residential

Existing Use: Municipal Rose Garden, City Landmark No. HS95-102

Proposed Zoning: No change

Proposed Use: Municipal Rose Garden, City Landmark No. HS95-102

GENERAL PLAN

Completed by: SNZ

Land Use/Transportation Diagram Designation
 Public Park and Open Space

Project Conformance:
☒ Yes ☐ No
☐ See Analysis and Recommendations

SURROUNDING LAND USES AND ZONING

Completed by: SNZ

North: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

East: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

South: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

West: Detached Single-family Residential

R-1-8 Residential

Completed by: SNZ

☐ Environmental Impact Report found complete
☐ Negative Declaration circulated on
☐ Negative Declaration adopted on

☒ Exempt
☐ Environmental Review Incomplete

FILE HISTORY

Completed by: SNZ

Annexation Title: College Park/Burbank Sur

Date: 9/08/1925

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION

☐ Approval
☐ Approval with Conditions
☐ Denial
☐ Uphold Director's Decision

Date: Nov. 6, 2002

Approved by: _____
☐ Action
☒ Recommendation

OWNER	DEVELOPER	ARCHITECT
Attn. Julie Mark, Deputy Director City of San Jose P.R.N.S. 1300 Senter Road San Jose CA 95112	Ron Cheung, Project Manager City of San Jose P.R.N.S. 2 No. 2 nd St., Suite 700 San Jose CA 95113	Gil Sanchez, F.A.I.A. 3012 Glen Canyon Rd. Santa Cruz CA 95066

PUBLIC AGENCY COMMENTS RECEIVED	Completed by: SNZ
Department of Public Works	
None	
Other Departments and Agencies	
None	

GENERAL CORRESPONDENCE
None

ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

BACKGROUND

The applicant, the City of San Jose Department of Parks, Recreation and Neighborhood Services is requesting a Historic Preservation permit to allow for exterior changes to San Jose's eleven acre Municipal Rose Garden, Historic Landmark No. HS95-102. The site is zoned R-1-8 Residential and is designated Public Park and Open Space on the adopted San Jose 2020 Land Use and Transportation Diagram. Surrounding land uses include single-family detached residential to the north across Emory Street, the south across Naglee Avenue, the east across Dana Avenue and the west across Garden Drive.

Historic Resource Description

This City Landmark appears to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, as per *Architectural Program and History of the Municipal Rose Garden Buildings*, dated August 5, 2002 by Gil Sanchez, FAIA, Architecture, Historic Preservation (attached).

The Santa Clara County Rose Society provided the inspiration for the Rose Garden. On November 20, 1927, the City Council of San Jose, at the suggestion of Mrs. Fremont Older and Mrs. Charles C. Derby, voted unanimously to set aside five and one-half acres on the eleven acre tract of City owned land located at Naglee and Dana Avenues for a municipal rose garden.

The ground breaking ceremony took place on April 7, 1931. The garden design was prepared by John McLaren, the noted landscape architect who designed Golden Gate Park in San Francisco. Dr. Horace McFarland of the American Rose Society and San Jose Planning Director Michael Antonacci were involved with the plan. The City Council of San Jose approved the plans on June 1, 1931.

Subsequent addition of the remaining five and one-half acres soon doubled the size of the Rose Garden. Saturday, May 15, 1937 marked the official dedication of the San Jose Municipal Rose Garden, which was to

honor Mr. John McLaren as guest speaker. A plaque, donated by Mrs. Andrew Christenson, was placed at the entrance of the garden. The Santa Clara Chamber of Commerce was also involved in the ground breaking ceremony.

The development of the park was largely a volunteer effort. The Santa Clara County Rose Society provided the original roses and employed an architect for the design of the entrance pillars and trellises. The members of the Building Trades and Central Labor Council donated skilled labor to construct the entrance. The brick pillars were completed in 1937. Numerous private individuals and nurseries donated the hundreds of roses, which have been planted over the years. Members of the Rose Society supplied a diagram, which was used to plant the roses in their proper positions. The reflection pool was presented to the Rose Garden by Mrs. Andrew Christenson in memory of her husband. Mrs. Charles C. Derby donated the sundial. The concrete benches and the large garden vases were gifts from Mrs. Ella Reed and Mr. and Mrs. Robert Borchers, respectively. In 1938-1939, the Works Progress Administration and the City of San Jose cooperated in constructing the two comfort station buildings.

The Native Daughters of the Golden West and the Native Sons of the Golden West planted the redwood groves in March of 1944. In 1951, a U.S. Navy airplane accidentally dropped an eight-inch long bomb, which penetrated four feet into the ground but did not explode. Bomb squads were called to remove it and discovered it was a dummy bomb. Funds for the two-tiered water fountain were donated in February of 1967 by an anonymous civic-minded individual concerned with the beauty of the garden. Miniature rose beds were installed and planted in April of 1973 and were donated by the Santa Clara County Rose Society. The installation of an irrigation system was completed in May of 1974. In 1988, the Santa Clara County Rose Society constructed a 63-foot long wooden arbor at the Dana Avenue entrance to the Rose Garden that was funded by San Jose Beautiful. In February of 1992, two wooden plaques, containing a location map and the history of the Rose Garden were added. Several picnic tables were added under the redwood trees on the north and west ends of the garden.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

Under the provisions of Section 15331 of the State Guidelines for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), this project is found to be exempt from environmental review in that the project is limited to the rehabilitation of a historical resource in a manner consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring and Reconstructing Historic Buildings (1995), Weeks and Grimmer as well as the The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for the Treatment of Cultural Landscapes (1996) Birnbaum.

GENERAL PLAN CONFORMANCE

The proposed project is consistent with the site's General Plan Land Use/Transportation Diagram designation of Public Park and Open Space. Additionally, the rehabilitation is consistent with the General Plan Historic, Archaeological and Cultural Resources Goal of the preservation of historically significant structures and districts in order to promote a greater sense of awareness and community identity and to enhance the quality of urban living.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The project proposes the rehabilitation of the two circa 1938 masonry comfort stations, the construction of a

new masonry maintenance structure and the installation of decomposed granite pathways for disabled access to the garden, new fencing and light fixtures.

Existing Comfort Stations

As a result of community meeting input, the existing women's restroom located near the Naglee Avenue entrance on the north side of the park will be converted to a men's restroom. The existing men's restroom on the south side of the park will be converted to a women's restroom.

To date, no information or historic image of the comfort stations has been located. Both comfort station exteriors will be rehabilitated to their 1939 appearance based on an interpretation of existing fabric. Additions and enclosures added over the years for storage will be removed. No additional square footage is proposed. Brick walls will be cleaned and repaired, existing windows and interior lights will be refurbished, and new steel doors painted the historic color will replace recently installed doors.

New Maintenance Building

The new maintenance structure will be located near what will now be the men's restroom on the north side of the park, in an area that is screened by existing Redwood trees. The building will have brick walls and a clay tile roof with a skylight. The pitch of the roof will be similar to that of the historic comfort stations. The new steel frame windows will have wired glass, similar to the historic windows. The green window color and terra cotta skylight color will be similar to the historic colors. Part of the walled enclosure is not roofed and will provide space for parking two electric carts and growing plant seedlings. A metal roll-down door provides access to this area.

Security Lighting

Security issues were of concern to the neighboring community members. Six additional light fixtures throughout the garden are proposed to increase security. The new luminaries will match the historic-style design and color of the existing fixtures found in the surrounding neighborhood outside of the garden. (Please see the lighting plan). Two fixtures will be located along the asphalt service road adjacent to each restroom and two will be located on each side of the stage area. These fixtures will provide lighting along the central path in order to increase visibility into the garden. Two fixtures will be located around the existing fountain. These will provide increased lighting for visitors entering the site from Dana Street.

Disabled Access Path

Presently, there is no access for disabled persons throughout the rose bush planting beds or to the men and women's restrooms. Several materials were explored in order to address budget, maintenance and impact on the historic resource. The decomposed granite material is the most compatible with what has historically been a grass site. The stabilizer binder will aid in handicap accessibility and will provide a more stable paving treatment.

The path will start at the northeast side of the park on Dana Street and continue underneath the arbor to the fountain. The path will provide access around the fountain as well as to the northwest and southwest directions towards the men's and women's restrooms. There will also be an ADA path from the fountain leading to the central path that will continue around the stage area and connect to the service road.

Fencing

The intent of the fencing improvements is to design a new fence that will be differentiated yet compatible in materials and design with the existing style of wrought iron fencing and brick columns on the Naglee Street entrance to the garden. All chain-link and barbed-wire fencing will be replaced with ornamental tubular steel fencing and brick columns will be erected at each corner and entrance to the garden.

ANALYSIS

The primary project issue is conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The project conforms to the Standards in general, and in particular to Standards Nos. one, and six and nine.

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
6. Deteriorated features from the restoration period will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

In May of 2002 the Historic Landmarks Commission Design Review Subcommittee reviewed the proposed project in its preliminary stage. Comments from that meeting are attached. The committee recommended that the original use and location of the men and women's restroom buildings should be maintained. While the project now proposes to exchange the men and women's restroom locations, it does maintain the original "comfort station" use without substantially altering the original building envelope or fabric.

The historic comfort stations' deteriorated features will be refurbished rather than replaced. The new doors will match the old in color.

The new maintenance enclosure, lighting fixtures, disabled access path and fencing will be compatible with the garden's historic materials and features in size, scale and proportion. The new maintenance enclosure materials will be clearly differentiated from the historic materials of the comfort stations and the proposed location will have minimal impact on the historic rose garden.

COMMUNITY OUTREACH

On June 17, 2002 the City of San Jose Department of Parks, Recreation and Neighborhood Services conducted a community meeting at Trace Elementary School. The meeting was well attended and comments from the public on the restroom rehabilitation and new maintenance structure were received. On August 15, 2002 a meeting was held to determine the community's preference for paving of proposed disabled access path.

A public hearing notice for the project was published in a local newspaper and mailed to all property owners and tenants within 500 feet of the subject site.

RECOMMENDATION

Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission find that the proposal conforms to the

Secretary of the Interior's Standards and recommend approval of the proposed alterations to the Director of Planning with standard conditions.

Attachments:

- DPR
- *Architectural Program and History of the Municipal Rose Garden Buildings*, by Gil Sanchez, FAIA, Architecture, Historic Preservation
- Information Sheet for Municipal Rose Garden Buildings Renovation, by City of San Jose, Public Works